

Defining and measuring craft: a review for the Crafts Council

Report two: proposals for a way forward



tbr knows... economics, creative, skills, environment



economic research &
business intelligence

Defining and measuring craft: a review for the Crafts Council

Proposals for a way forward

18/06/2013

This document has been produced by TBR on behalf of the Crafts Council. Its contents may be re-produced for inclusion elsewhere, provided that this content is appropriately credited and referenced.

Enquiries about this report can be addressed to;



Document Information

Project Reference Number	PN01713R
File Name	PN01713R_TBRReport2_ProposalsForAWayForward_v2
Title	Defining and measuring craft: a review for the Crafts Council
Version number	V2
Last update	12/06/13
Name of Author	Fiona Dodd
Name of Reviewer	Anna Morgan
Document Status	Public
Review Status	Complete
Approval Status	Final

Table of Contents

INTRODUCTION 1
DOCUMENT STRUCTURE..... 1

CRAFT’S CURRENT POSITION IN THE DEFINITION PROPOSED BY DCMS 1
PROPOSALS FOR A WAY FORWARD 1

FINDING CRAFT IN THE SOC SYSTEM 1
WHERE IS IT?..... 1

PROPOSALS FOR THE FUTURE POSITION OF CRAFT IN A NEW DEFINITION 1
PROPOSAL ONE: REVISE THE OCCUPATIONS 1
PROPOSAL TWO: REVISE THE INDUSTRIES AND OCCUPATIONS 1

APPENDIX 1
DETAILED DATA TABLES..... 1

1. Introduction

The first few months of 2013 saw the publication of a number of reports relating to the definition of the creative industries, culminating with the launch of consultations on the subject by the Department for Culture, Media and Sport (DCMS), Creative Skillset and Creative & Cultural Skills in April 2013. Key documents are as follows:

- Nesta (Jan 2013) A dynamic mapping of the UK's creative industries¹
- Creative Skillset (Feb 2013) Classifying and measuring the creative industries²
- DCMS (Apr 2013) Classifying and measuring the creative industries consultation³
- Spilsbury & Godward (Apr 2013) Review of Industrial and Occupational Classification Systems
- Creative & Cultural Skills (Apr 2013) Measuring the creative industries: a discussion⁴
- Nesta (Apr 2013) A manifesto for the creative economy⁵
- Maria Miller (Apr 2013 speech) Testing times: Fighting culture's corner in an age of austerity⁶

In this context, the Crafts Council commissioned TBR to undertake a review considering:

1. The methods of defining and measuring craft used by other agencies in recent years.
2. The position of craft in new definition proposed by DCMS and the Creative Skillset/Creative & Cultural Skills consultation on classification systems.

This document is the second of two produced and deals specifically with point two above. A separate document is available relating to point one. For those who are less familiar with the background to the DCMS consultation, or the recent history of craft definitions, we would recommend reading paper one before this paper.

1.1 Document structure

This document is divided into two main sections:

- **Craft's current position in the definition proposed by DCMS:** This section considers the current position of craft in the proposed definition, the key issues we believe have led to this and summarises the proposed solutions.
- **Finding craft in the SOC system:** This section explores where craft should be found in the Standard Occupational Classification (SOC) system, providing an overview of the challenges faced in this and suggests which codes should be used.
- **Proposals for the future position of craft in a new definition:** This section moves on to present two proposals for routes forward that would ensure craft is explicitly represented in the DCMS' measurement of the creative industries.

¹ http://www.Nesta.org.uk/home1/assets/blog_entries/dynamic_mapping

² http://www.creativeskillset.org/research/activity/classifications/article_9067_1.asp

³ <https://www.gov.uk/government/consultations/classifying-and-measuring-the-creative-industries-consultation-on-proposed-changes>

⁴ <http://ccskills.org.uk/news/story/consultation-launched-to-classify-and-measure-the-creative-industries>

⁵ http://www.Nesta.org.uk/home1/assets/features/a_manifesto_for_the_creative_economy

⁶ <https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/testing-times-fighting-cultures-corner-in-an-age-of-austerity>

2. Craft's current position in the definition proposed by DCMS

In the DCMS consultation document⁷ craft is present in the proposed definition and measurement of the creative industries, to the extent that the design element of making any item is clearly captured but not explicitly recognised. It could reasonably be argued that this is merely a question of product. Designer fashion is now covered purely from a design perspective, any elements for the actual making of clothing have been removed; as such the activity included is the same for craft, i.e. the process up to the point of making an item. Therefore, without any change to the method and simply some changes in terminology or description, craft (or rather the design aspect of being a designer/maker) could be recognised in the definition as it stands.

However, we also feel there is scope for craft to be explicitly included, classified and measured.

The approach proposed is driven by the creative intensity of Standard Industrial Classifications (SICs). The creative intensity is the percentage of workers in an SIC code that are employed within SOCs that have been designated as creative. Any SIC that employs in excess of 30% of people in the designated SOCs is recognised as being a creative industry. As such, the intensities (and therefore the identification of creative industries) are driven by the SOCs that have been designated as creative. With this in mind, it is vital to ensure that the list of SOCs designated as creative fully reflects creative practice.

The DCMS recognises that this is challenging⁸:

'...the selection of creative occupations is a matter for professional judgement, based on what is known about the occupational group in question, allied to the definition of that occupation in the SOC classification. It is not a data-based analysis [...] Although the Nesta report does set out a transparent framework within which this professional judgement of creativity can be brought to bear on the different occupations in the economy.'

We believe that the GRID scoring approach suggested by Nesta, which considers how many of five criteria an occupation complies with⁹ and flags as creative those scoring four or more, is a useful and logical system to put in place to guide the selection of SOCs. However, it is vital to ensure sufficient objectivity, sectoral/occupational knowledge and understanding of the SOC system in the scoring process.

In looking across the Nesta and Creative Skillset reports, Craft is inconsistently covered. The Nesta report provides GRID scores for all but two of the SOCs that were used by the DCMS between 2002 and 2011 to describe Craft. For some reason SOC 5492 and 5494 were excluded and SOC 5496 was included¹⁰. Only two codes scored 4 or higher and were included: SOCs 5491 and 5495¹¹. Subsequently the SICs 2341 and 3212¹² were also included throughout the Nesta analysis, although volatility is noted as an issue with the SICs.

Craft is not taken forward at all in the Creative Skillset¹³ report.

'There are no craft roles included here – whilst it is clear that some elements of these craft occupations contain a creative element, the view is that in the main, these roles are more concerned with the manufacturing process, rather than the creative process. The removal of a number of craft roles from the 2010 SOC listing (Goldsmiths, Silversmiths, Precious Stone workers, for example) into the more generic 'Other skilled trades' occupational group has exacerbated this;'

⁷ DCMS (2013) Classifying and Measuring the Creative Industries: Consultation on Proposed Changes

⁸ DCMS (2013) Classifying and Measuring the Creative Industries: Consultation on Proposed Changes

⁹ Nesta (2013) section 5, from page 26

¹⁰ SOC 5492: Furniture makers, other craft woodworkers, SOC 5494: Musical Instrument makers and tuners, SOC 5496: Floral arrangers, florists

¹¹ SOC 5491: Glass and Ceramics makers, decorators and finishers, SOC 5495: Goldsmiths, Silversmiths, Precious Stone workers,

¹² SIC 2341: Manufacture of ceramic household and ornamental articles, SIC 3212: Manufacture of jewellery and related articles

¹³ Creative Skillset (2013) Classifying and measuring the creative industries

We feel that the GRID scoring and the statement above reflect two fundamental issues:

1. A need to enhance understanding of craft practice and how intrinsically creative it is.
2. A need to review where craft activity is truly captured in the SOC system.

Clarifying these would, we feel, lead to the designation as creative of highly relevant craft SOCs.

2.1 Proposals for a way forward

With this in mind, in order to more explicitly include craft, we suggest that the Crafts Council requests a review of the SOCs that are used. We feel the following are reasonable proposals for revisions that retain the method proposed and enable the legitimate inclusion of craft:

1. **Revise the occupations (SOCs) that have been designated as creative.** The simplest approach would be to introduce employment in a set of SOCs without changing the SIC definition. This would mean most change occurs in element 3 of the trident, those employed within creative occupations outside creative industries. This would also mean that craft continues to (mainly) be captured in this definition as it used to be in the DCMS Economic Estimates.
2. **Revise the industries (SICs) and occupations (SOCs) that have been defined as creative.** Changing the SOCs may naturally give rise to changing the SIC definition; adding to the SOCs that are considered creative may push other SICs over Nesta's 30% threshold. There are grounds for this; Nesta's own analysis acknowledges the validity of including SICs 3212 and 2341¹⁴. The issue would be the reliability of underlying estimates. It would also be important to consider whether such a narrow range of SICs is helpful in describing craft.

¹⁴ SIC 3212: manufacture of jewellery and related articles, SIC 2341: manufacture of ceramic household and ornamental articles

3. Finding craft in the SOC system

Before considering the proposals in more detail, it is important to spend some time reflecting on the SOCs that should be used. Whilst the GRID scoring is a key underpinning process, before even getting to this point it is important to be confident that the SOCs that are GRID scored are those most likely to capture craft.

A review of the key pieces of mapping work¹⁵ that have covered craft in recent years identifies the following shortlist of commonly used SOCs. The table shows the development of the SOCs across the three SOC classification systems that have been in place over the period.

Table 1: Shortlist of SOCs commonly used to describe craft between 1998 and 2012

SOC 1990	SOC 2000	SOC 2000 Description	SOC 2010	SOC 2010 Description	SOC 2010 detailed description
382	3422	Product, clothing and related designers	3422	Product, clothing and related designers	Product, clothing and related designers plan, direct and undertake the creation of designs for new industrial and commercial products, clothing and related fashion accessories, costumes and wigs, and for building interiors and stage sets.
530	5211	Smiths and forge workers	5211	Smiths and forge workers	Smiths and forge workers operate or direct the operation of power hammers and presses to shape heated metal to requirements and to make and repair a variety of metal articles by heating, hammering and bending. Bends or shapes metal by hand forging methods using hammers, punches, drifts and other hand tools.
550 551	5411	Weavers and knitters	5411	Weavers and knitters	Weavers and knitters set up and operate hand and power operated looms and machines to weave fibre into fabrics and carpet, or to knit (by machine or by hand) garments and other articles from yarn.
554	5412	Upholsterers	5412	Upholsterers	Job holders in this unit group upholster vehicle, aircraft and other seating, fix trimmings to the interiors of vehicles and aircraft, upholster furniture such as chairs and sofas, and make mattresses, curtains and other soft furnishings.
562	5423	Bookbinders and print finishers	5423	Print finishing and binding workers	Print finishing and binding workers bind books and other publications and finish printed items by hand or machine.
590 591	5491	Glass and Ceramics makers, decorators and finishers	5441	Glass and ceramics makers, decorators and finishers	Glass and ceramics workers, form, shape, decorate, smooth and polish glassware, earthenware, refractory goods, clay bricks and other ceramic goods.
571 579	5492	Furniture makers, other craft woodworkers	5442	Furniture makers and other craft woodworkers	Furniture makers and other craft woodworkers make, repair and restore wooden furniture, decorative objects and other crafted pieces of woodwork.
593	5494	Musical Instrument makers and tuners	5449	Other skilled trades n.e.c	Workers in this unit group engrave jewellery and stoneware, make artificial hairpieces, charge fireworks and munitions with explosive material, make lampshades, wickerwork, toys, dolls, models, candles, artificial flowers, other fancy goods, make patterns for moulds for metal castings, make and tune musical instruments, craft precious metals and stones, and perform other hand craft occupations not elsewhere classified.
518	5495	Goldsmiths, Silversmiths, Precious Stone workers			
599	5499	Hand Craft occupations not elsewhere classified (n.e.c)			

Sources: TBR (2013) and ONS Standard Occupational Classification 2010, Volume 1 Structure and descriptions of unit groups

Many jobs/activities may be included within an individual SOC code. The information provided by Office for National Statistics (ONS) within manuals can be limited and is often not very illuminating. If one

¹⁵ TBR (2013) Defining & Measuring Craft: a review for the Crafts Council - Paper one: craft definitions 1998 - 2012

looks at the list of jobs covered, many may appear to have mechanised equivalents; which would account for a score of zero against criterion 2 (resistance to mechanisation) in the Nesta paper. Further complication arises through the term 'craft' being widely used and accepted in the building trade to refer to activities such as joinery, plumbing, roofing etc. However, the crucial point is that the mechanised equivalent is covered elsewhere in the SOC system, as is the often conflated construction equivalent. For example:

Table 2: Comparison of occupation descriptions

Craft SOC	Mechanised equivalent	Construction trade equivalent
5441 Glass and ceramics makers, decorators and finishers Glass and ceramics workers, form, shape, decorate, smooth and polish glassware, earthenware, refractory goods, clay bricks and other ceramic goods.	8112 Glass and ceramics process operatives Glass and ceramics process operatives position articles ready for firing in kilns and operate and attend furnaces and kilns to make and treat glass and ceramic items.	5316 Glaziers, window fabricators and fitters Job holders in this unit group install pre-glazed wooden, metal or PVC framework, and cut, fit and set glass in windows, doors, shop fronts, and other structural frames.
5442 Furniture makers and other craft woodworkers Furniture makers and other craft woodworkers make, repair and restore wooden furniture, decorative objects and other crafted pieces of woodwork.	8121 Paper and wood machine operatives Paper and wood machine operatives operate machines to treat and cut wood, to produce, treat and cut paper, paperboard, leatherboard, plasterboard and similar material, and to assemble and make wooden crates and containers.	5315 Carpenters and joiners Carpenters and joiners construct, erect, install and repair wooden structures and fittings used in internal and external frameworks and cut, shape, fit and assemble wood to make templates, jigs, scale models and scenic equipment for theatres.
5411 Weavers and knitters Weavers and knitters set up and operate hand and power operated looms and machines to weave fibre into fabrics and carpet, or to knit (by machine or by hand) garments and other articles from yarn.	8113 Textile process operatives Job holders in this unit group operate machines to prepare natural and synthetic fibres for processing, spin and twist fibre into yarn, thread, twine, rope and other similar material, and estimate the quantities of colouring matter required for printing and dyeing fabrics.	n/a

Source: ONS Standard Occupational Classification 2010, Volume 1 Structure and descriptions of unit groups

That confusion arises across codes is understandable. Working with a particular material has long been the root of a craft definition. In the absence of a firm definition of what constitutes craft practice, the tendency is to seek craft wherever an occupation is defined as interacting with a relevant material. However, this approach belies the truth: that creative craft practice can be and is represented in the SOC system.

3.1 Where is it?

As previously noted, one issue cited for not including craft occupational codes in the Creative Skillset paper is that the SOC2010 system has reduced the number of craft codes, and that these have been subsumed into groups with less skilled workers that cannot be considered credible to include.

However, the list in Table 1 (page 5) shows that on the face of it, the main change is to the 2000 SOC catch-all category of 'Hand Craft occupations n.e.c.' (5499) which in 2010 SOC has changed into 5449 Other Skilled Trades n.e.c. The other SOCs all remain valid crafts occupations.

Table 3 below provides some insight into the contents of this new 2010 SOC 5449. The SOC manual provides a long list of job titles, each of which is associated with an SOC. The table counts the number of occurrences of a job title being linked to SOC 5449 and also shows which SOC the job title was linked to in the old SOC 2000 system. The final column notes whether or not the 2000 SOC appears in the list of SOCs commonly used to describe craft (as per Table 1, page 5). The table shows that 94% of the content of SOC 5449 has always been considered as relevant to craft.

Table 3: The contents of 2010 SOC 5449

SOC2000	SOC 2000 Description	Job title occurrences	SOC 2000 in the craft shortlist
5499	Hand craft occupations n.e.c.	233	Yes
5495	Goldsmiths, silversmiths, precious stone workers	112	Yes
5494	Musical instrument makers and tuners	50	Yes
5493	Pattern makers (moulds)	9	No
5323	Painters and decorators	8	No
8131	Assemblers (electrical products)	2	No
5213	Sheet metal workers	1	No
5223	Metal working production and maintenance fitters	1	No
5315	Carpenters and joiners	1	No
5419	Textiles, garments and related trades n.e.c.	1	No
8116	Plastics process operatives	1	No
9134	Packers, bottlers, canners, fillers	1	No
Total occurrences		420	
Total in shortlist		395	
% in shortlist		94%	

Source: ONS SOC 2010 Index (TBR Ref: W1/S5)

So what about the other 6%? The table below shows that there has been a clear move to incorporate writing and sign making in SOC 5449; picking up instances where these practices have previously been included in SOCs where the application of skilled knowledge and/or creativity is not paramount. Specifically, separating writing from painting, and decorating and sign making from assembly.

Table 4: The 6% of jobs not from common craft SOCs

SOC2000	SOC 2000 Description	Job title	
5213	Sheet metal workers	Maker, sign	
5223	Metal working production and maintenance fitters	Fabricator, sign	
5315	Carpenters and joiners	Maker, sign	
5323	Painters and decorators	Writer	
5323		Writer	
5323		Writer to the trade	
5323		Writer, glass	
5323		Writer, letter	
5323		Writer, poster	
5323		Writer, sign	
5323		Writer, ticket	
5419		Textiles, garments and related trades n.e.c.	Modeller
5493		Pattern makers (moulds)	Assembler, wax
5493	Foreman, shop, pattern		
5493	Maker, model		
5493	Maker, mould		
5493	Maker, pattern		

SOC2000	SOC 2000 Description	Job title
5493		Maker, pattern
5493		Maker, pattern, engineer's
5493		Maker, pattern, wood
5493		Man, mould
8116	Plastics process operatives	Maker, sign
8131	Assemblers (electrical products)	Maker, sign
8131		Maker, sign
9134	Packers, bottlers, canners, fillers	Packer, parachute

Source: ONS SOC 2010 Index (TBR Ref: W1/S9)

However, the important point is that these jobs have been moved into SOC 5449 by the ONS because they are considered to more accurately reflect the type of work encapsulated by SOC 5449 than the SOCs they were previously in. As such, if we accept that 5449 accurately reflects craft practice, then we accept that these activities belong here and should be counted.

To this end, we suggest that the following SOCs, which have always formed the core of a 'best fit' measurement of craft, should still be included in the GRID scoring process. We also argue that the relevance of SOC 3422 Product, clothing and related designers to the craft sector should be clarified in the description of the sector.

Table 5: SOCs to be included in the definition

SOC 2010	SOC 2010 Description
5211	Smiths and forge workers
5411	Weavers and knitters
5412	Upholsterers
5423	Print finishing and binding workers
5441	Glass and ceramics makers, decorators and finishers
5442	Furniture makers and other craft woodworkers
5449	Other skilled trades n.e.c.

For the purposes of this review, these occupations have all been GRID scored; the results of which are shown in Table 6 (below). The element of these GRID score that we assume will raise most questions is that none are considered to be resistant to mechanisation. To fulfil this criterion, the person must 'clearly contribute something for which there is no mechanical substitute'¹⁶. The important point here is substitution. It is vital to take into consideration the skilled use of machines or tools to execute/support the creative process in craft, but not replace it.

In this sense it is useful to reflect on definitions used in TBR's 2012 project for Creative & Cultural Skills: Mapping Heritage Craft¹⁷. In this research the following categories of machine or tool use were developed:

1. Use of hand tools, whereby all parts of the process are executed using hand held and operated tools only.
2. Skilled use of automated machinery, whereby part of the process is automated, but part still requires skilled interaction from an operator to execute it fully.
3. Use of automated machinery which requires little skill, whereby the operator needs only basic training in how the machine works to execute the process.

¹⁶ Nesta (2013) A dynamic mapping of the UK's creative industries

¹⁷ TBR for Creative & Cultural Skills (2013) Mapping Heritage Craft

It was recognised that all three might be present in craft practice. However, if the third alone was used then the activity could not be truly considered craft practice. We suggest that, similarly, if the third type of activity was potentially present in these SOCs then they would not warrant a score for mechanisation resistance. However, as demonstrated in Table 2 (page 6), those SOCs which involve basic machine use are captured elsewhere in the SOC system.

The only criterion that we believe that the SOCs do not meet is non-repeating output. This is because it is entirely possible for a maker to decide not to vary the process and make a batch of the same item.

Table 6: Revised GRID score for suggested craft SOCs

SOC 2010	SOC 2010 Description	GRID Score	Process novelty	Resistant to mechanisation	Non-repeating output	Creative function in process	Interpretation not transformation
5211	Smiths and forge workers	4	1	1		1	1
5411	Weavers and knitters	4	1	1		1	1
5412	Upholsterers	4	1	1		1	1
5423	Print finishing and binding workers	4	1	1		1	1
5441	Glass and ceramics makers, decorators and finishers	4	1	1		1	1
5442	Furniture makers and other craft woodworkers	4	1	1		1	1
5449	Other skilled trades n.e.c.	4	1	1		1	1

4. Proposals for the future position of craft in a new definition

For the purposes of testing the proposals and understanding how the integration of craft changes the footprint, we have recreated the trident¹⁸ using a slightly earlier set of data; Annual Population Survey for October 2010 to September 2011, rather than the four quarters of Labour Force Survey March 2011 to April 2012 that were used in the Creative Skillset paper.¹⁹

Table 7: Recreated creative trident

Element of trident	Recreated estimate	How is this calculated?
1. Creative employment within creative industries	748k	The total number of people working in a specified creative SOCs in the specified creative SICs.
2. Non-creative employment within creative industries	605k	The total number of remaining people working in the specified creative SICs that are not in specified creative SOCs.
Total in creative industries	1,353m	
3. Creative employment in non-creative industries	903k	The total number of people working in the specified creative SOCs that are not working in specified creative SICs
Total creative	2,257m	

Source: Annual Population Survey October 2010 to September 2011 (TBR Ref: W2/S3)

4.1 Proposal one: Revise the occupations

The simplest approach would be to introduce employment in a set of SOCs without changing the SIC definition. This would mean most change occurs in element 3 of the trident, those employed within creative occupations outside creative industries. This would also mean that craft continues to (mainly) be captured in this definition as it used to be in the DCMS Economic Estimates.

Table 8 shows the total employment in the recommended Craft SOCs. A small proportion (9.8k) of these people are employed in SICs that are currently included in the definition as creative industries and as such are already counted in element 2 of the trident as part of other creative industries. This means that there are 127.6k people working in craft occupations in SICs that are not currently considered creative industries to integrate into element 3 of the trident.

Table 8: Total employment in Craft SOCs

SOC	SOC Description	Total employment	Already counted in element 2 of trident	Additional to integrate to element 3 of trident
5211	Smiths and forge workers	5,250	0	5,250
5411	Weavers and knitters	2,430	0	2,430
5412	Upholsterers	14,340	180	14,160
5423	Print finishing and binding workers	18,020	1,650	16,370
5441	Glass and ceramics makers, decorators and finishers	11,150	730	10,420
5442	Furniture makers and other craft woodworkers	49,230	1,340	47,890
5449	Other skilled trades n.e.c.	37,050	5,930	31,130
	Total	137,470	9,820	127,650

Source: Annual Population Survey October 2010 to September 2011 (TBR Ref: W2/S4)

¹⁸ Figure 6 in the DCMS consultation document and Figure 12 in the Creative Skillset report

¹⁹ This testing has given rise to some questions about volatility, which is a separate issue to explore with the DCMS, particularly the dramatically different size of element 3. The Creative Skillset estimate of this group was 738k people, using the same definition with a different dataset produces an estimate of 903k people.

This would change the trident as per Table 9 below:

- There is no change in the overall size of the creative industries. Rather, there is a rebalancing of employment between elements 1 and 2 as the 9,820 people employed in craft SOCs in Creative Industries SICs are re-classified as being in creative employment in another creative industry (and therefore no longer – in theory - belong to craft).
- There is an increase in element 3 of the trident (of 127,650) as the remaining people employed in craft SOCs outside of the Creative Industries SICs are integrated.

Table 9: Creative trident, including craft SOCs in element 3

Element of trident	Recreated estimate	Including Craft SOCs
1.Creative employment within creative industries	748,150	757,970
2.Non-creative employment within creative industries	605,790	595,970
Total in creative industries	1,353,930	1,353,930
3.Creative employment in non-creative industries	903,960	1,031,610
Total creative	2,257,900	2,385,540

Source: Annual Population Survey October 2010 to September 2011 (TBR Ref: W2/S3)

It should be noted that this approach requires a slight change to the Nesta methodology, as it does not propose to change the SIC definition on the basis of revised creative intensities (see proposal two). Our initial investigations suggest it is unlikely to significantly increase the volatility within the current proposed Creative Industries SICs. It may be advisable to investigate whether it creates significant volatility within the creative occupations outside creative industries group. However, we feel this group already warrants further investigation, given the large difference between datasets in this investigation and the Creative Skillset paper.

4.1.1 What would the definition look like?

A short coming of the way in which the definition and measurement is currently presented in the DCMS and Creative Skillset papers is it does not provide an accessible breakdown of how the figures in the trident are derived. We would suggest, even if these proposals for the integration of craft are not taken forward, that data is presented by sub-sector and trident element. For example:

Table 10: Presenting the new definition – summary table for proposal one

	Trident 1 Emp in creative occupations in creative industries	Trident 2 Emp in non-creative occupations in creative industries	Trident 3 Emp in creative occupations in non creative industries	Total Creative employment
Broad Creative Industries Group				
Advertising and marketing	83,480	65,610	388,660	537,760
Architecture	60,470	32,910	33,780	127,150
Craft			127,650	127,650
Design and designer fashion	55,280	40,120	50,630	146,030
Film, TV, video, radio and photography	116,600	70,370	12,640	199,600
IT, software and computer services	212,190	222,960	281,270	716,410
Music, performing and visual arts	122,530	60,710	88,680	271,920
Publishing	107,420	103,280	48,320	259,020
Total	757,970	595,970	1,031,610	2,385,540

Source: Annual Population Survey October 2010 to September 2011 (TBR Ref: W2/S9b)

We would also suggest providing more detailed breakdowns, for those who would like further detail, for example Table 14 in the appendix (page 16). Ideally, a full SIC/SOC matrix would be available on request.

4.2 Proposal two: Revise the industries and occupations

Changing the SOCs may naturally give rise to changing the SIC definition; adding to the SOCs that are considered creative may push other SICs over Nesta's 30% threshold. There are grounds for this; Nesta's own analysis acknowledges the validity of including SICs 3212 and 2341²⁰. The issue would be the reliability of underlying estimates. It would also be important to consider whether such a narrow range of SICs is helpful in describing craft.

In order to truly retain the Nesta method, including these SOCs means that the creative intensities should be recalculated to ascertain if any other SICs are above the 30% threshold. The 30% threshold is also accompanied by an ONS guideline that in excess of 10,000 people should be employed in total in the SIC. However, the ONS 10,000 figure has a confidence interval of 4,000. I.e. the actual estimate could be between 6,000 and 14,000 - so effectively 4,000 either way. As such, we have considered intensities at 30% and both 10,000 and 6,000 total employment.

Table 11 shows the results of this investigation, which suggests that at 10,000 one additional SIC could be included, at 6,000 a further six. The seven in total include five that are predominantly craft and two where the craft SOCs make a minor contribution, but the addition to the other creative SOCs pushes the SIC over the threshold.

²⁰ SIC 3212: manufacture of jewellery and related articles, SIC 2341: manufacture of ceramic household and ornamental articles

Table 11: Additional SICs with a 30%+ creative intensity when including craft SOCs

SIC	SIC Description	Total emp	Total emp in Skillset & additional craft SOCs	Creative Intensity	Total emp greater than 10,000	Total emp greater than 6,000	Total Craft	Total Skillset SOCs	% craft	% Creative Skillset	% non-creative
3212	Manufacture of jewellery and related articles	7,650	5,920	77.4%	N	Y	5,200	720	68%	9%	23%
2341	Manufacture of ceramic household and ornamental articles	6,850	4,750	69.4%	N	Y	3,820	930	56%	14%	31%
9524	Repair of furniture and home furnishings	9,210	5,980	64.9%	N	Y	4,600	1,380	50%	15%	35%
1814	Binding and related services	8,840	4,090	46.2%	N	Y	3,120	970	35%	11%	54%
3109	Manufacture of other furniture	46,340	18,860	40.7%	Y	Y	18,060	800	39%	2%	59%
1813	Pre-press and pre-media services	9,320	3,620	38.9%	N	Y	230	3,390	3%	36%	61%
3240	Manufacture of games and toys	7,650	5,920	30.3%	N	Y	530	1,980	6%	24%	70%

Source: Annual Population Survey October 2010 to September 2011 (TBR Ref: W2/S6)

These numbers serve to highlight the key challenge for craft: a lack of critical mass in SICs. This is really driven by the fact that the craft is embodied by process, rather than product. As such, when considered through the SIC lens, which is driven by products and materials, craft will always be scattered across the system. The sole trader nature of craft activity will also mean that even in SICs where the majority of activity is creative the fact that they are not large employers will mean that the total size is comparatively small.

SICs 3212, 2341 and 9524 in Table 11 above have very high creative intensities, but lack the numbers to be considered for inclusion. However, one really cannot question the logic in the Nesta method that these should be considered as creative industries. The small proportion of employees not in creative roles must be auxiliary to the creative process and surely warrant inclusion as non-creative employment within the creative industries. Whilst recognising that this might raise questions for other SICs, we therefore feel it would be worth a conversation with the ONS to consider in more detail how the 10,000 threshold/4,000 confidence interval for total employment should be applied.

Given that the Nesta definition adheres to the 10,000 principle, at this stage the only SIC that could qualify to be integrated as an additional creative industries SIC would be SIC 3109: manufacture of other furniture. This raises the consideration of whether it is helpful to have a single SIC representing only one element of craft in the footprint styled as craft. However, following the method necessitates its inclusion.

These issues underline the importance of having an appropriate SOC classification that captures the designing and making process, regardless of the materials used or the products produced. To this end, we feel that the Crafts Council, DCMS and partners should champion the creation of a collective 'designer/maker' SOC. The starting point for which would be further aggregation of the current SOC's commonly categorised as craft. This is more a point for the concurrent Spilsbury & Godward consultation, but grouping craft practitioners more effectively should simplify the ONS sampling strategy and enable craft to gain more critical mass in official statistics.

Introducing the craft SOC's and the single SIC 3109 would change the trident as follows:

- The rebalancing of elements 1 and 2 and increase in element 3 as seen in Table 9 above.
- An increase in element 1 of the trident, through the addition of 18,858 people in SIC 3109 in creative employment.
- An increase in element 2 of the trident, through the addition of 27,485 people in SIC 3109 in non-creative employment.
- The increase in element 3 of the trident is not as large as seen in Table 9, as the 18,858 people in creative roles in 3109 are included in element 1.

Table 12: Creative trident, including craft SOC's in element 3

Element of trident	Recreated estimate	Revised craft SOC's + SIC 3109
1. Creative employment within creative industries	748,150	776,830
2. Non-creative employment within creative industries	605,790	623,450
Total in creative industries	1,353,930	1,400,280
3. Creative employment in non-creative industries	903,960	1,012,750
Total creative	2,257,900	2,413,030

Source: Annual Population Survey October 2010 to September 2011 (TBR Ref: W2/S8)

4.2.1 What would the definition look like?

Using the same format as the tables in for proposal one, the final trident would be as follows:

Table 13: Presenting the new definition – summary table for proposal two

Broad Creative Industries Group	Trident 1 Emp in creative occupations in creative industries	Trident 2 Emp in non-creative occupations in creative industries	Trident 3 Emp in creative occupations in non creative industries	Total Creative
Advertising and marketing	83,480	65,610	388,180	537,280
Architecture	60,470	32,910	33,780	127,150
Craft	18,860	27,490	109,590	155,930
Design and designer fashion	55,280	40,120	50,310	145,710
Film, TV, video, radio and photography	116,600	70,370	12,640	199,600
IT, software and computer services	212,190	222,960	281,270	716,410
Music, performing and visual arts	122,530	60,710	88,680	271,920
Publishing	107,420	103,280	48,320	259,020
Total	776,830	623,450	1,012,750	2,413,030

Source: Annual Population Survey October 2010 to September 2011 (TBR Ref: W2/S10b)

Again, we also suggest providing more detailed breakdowns, for those who would like further detail, for example Table 15 in the appendix (page 18). Ideally, a full SIC/SOC matrix would be available on request.

A final note on the subject of SICs is that we feel much consternation is caused by the description of people as being 'outside of' or in 'non-creative industries'. Whilst this may make perfect sense for researchers, or for the examples such as a musician on a cruise ship, this doesn't make sense for a designer/maker whose business is a creative enterprise. As such, it may be advisable to consider alternative terminology or clearer notes/caveats with the current descriptions.

5. Appendix

5.1 Detailed data tables

NB. We are unclear as to which broad group Librarians and Archivist & Curators belong. We have included them here in music, performing and visual arts.

Table 14: Presenting the new definition for proposal one – detailed breakdown

Broad CI Group	SIC/ SOC	Code	Description	Trident 1 Emp in creative occupations in creative industries	Trident 2 Emp in non- creative occupations in creative industries	Trident 3 Emp in creative occupations in non creative industries
Advertising and marketing	SIC	7021	PR & communication activities	15,580	9,200	
	SIC	7311	Advertising agencies	50,880	44,740	
	SIC	7312	Media representation	17,030	11,680	
	SOC	1132	Marketing and sales directors			245,110
	SOC	1134	Advertising and Public Relations Directors			15,080
	SOC	2473	Advertising accounts managers and creative directors			6,070
	SOC	3543	Marketing associate professionals			122,400
Architecture	SIC	7111	Architectural activities	60,470	32,910	
	SOC	2431	Architects			12,900
	SOC	2432	Town planners			9,680
	SOC	2435	Chartered architectural technologists			770
	SOC	3121	Architectural and town planning technicians			10,440
Craft	SOC	5211	Smiths and forge workers			5,250
	SOC	5411	Weavers and knitters			2,430
	SOC	5412	Upholsterers			14,160
	SOC	5423	Print finishing and binding workers			16,370
	SOC	5441	Glass and ceramics makers, decorators and finishers			10,420
	SOC	5442	Furniture makers and other craft woodworkers			47,890
	SOC	5449	Other skilled trades n.e.c.			31,130
Design and designer fashion	SIC	7410	Specialised design activities	55,280	40,120	
	SOC	3421	Graphic Designers			23,460
	SOC	3422	Product, Clothing and related designers			27,170
Film, TV, video, radio and photography	SIC	5911	Motion picture, video & TV programme production activities	41,740	14,810	
	SIC	7420	Photographic activities	35,150	11,160	
	SIC	6020	TV programming & broadcasting activities	20,820	17,760	
	SIC	6010	Radio broadcasting	12,390	5,620	
	SIC	5912	Motion picture, video & TV programme post-production activities	3,110	1,900	
	SIC	5914	Motion picture projection activities	2,570	15,480	
	SIC	5913	Motion picture, video & TV programme distribution activities	830	3,640	

	SOC	3417	Photographers, audio-visual and broadcasting equipment operators			12,640
IT, software and computer services	SIC	6201	Computer programming activities	126,550	85,240	
	SIC	6202	Computer consultancy activities	85,630	137,720	
	SOC	1136	Information technology and telecommunications directors			82,370
	SOC	2135	IT business analysts, architects and systems designers			45,830
	SOC	2136	Programmers and software development professionals			135,990
	SOC	2137	Web design and development professionals			17,070
Music, performing and visual arts	SIC	9003	Artistic creation	61,880	5,320	
	SIC	9001	Performing arts	31,180	9,260	
	SIC	8552	Cultural education	10,400	22,480	
	SIC	9004	Operation of arts facilities	7,680	13,590	
	SIC	9002	Support activities to performing arts	7,540	6,380	
	SIC	5920	Sound recording & music publishing activities	3,870	3,690	
	SOC	2451	Librarians			28,600
	SOC	2452	Archivists & curators			8,100
	SOC	3411	Artists			7,640
	SOC	3413	Actors, entertainers and presenters			19,310
	SOC	3414	Dancers and choreographers			5,080
	SOC	3415	Musicians			10,080
SOC	3416	Arts officers, producers and directors			9,870	
Publishing	SIC	5814	Publishing of journals & periodicals	26,620	17,460	
	SIC	5813	Publishing of newspapers	23,160	26,910	
	SIC	5811	Book publishing	22,460	21,790	
	SIC	5819	Other publishing activities	15,120	21,070	
	SIC	7430	Translation and interpretation activities	10,710	3,240	
	SIC	5829	Other software publishing	8,220	10,220	
	SIC	5812	Publishing of directories and mailing lists	810	1,090	
	SIC	5821	Publishing of computer games	340	1,500	
	SOC	2471	Journalists, Newspaper and Periodical editors			9,740
	SOC	2472	Public relations professionals			22,500
	SOC	3412	Authors, writers and translators			16,090
Sub-totals				757,970	595,970	1,031,610
Grand Total						2,385,540

Source: Annual Population Survey October 2010 to September 2011 (TBR Ref: W2/S9a)

Table 15: Presenting the new definition for proposal two – detailed breakdown

Broad CI Group	SIC/ SOC	Code	SIC Description	Trident 1 Total emp in creative occupations	Trident 2 Total emp in non-creative occupations	Trident 3 Total Emp in non Creative Skillset SICs
Advertising and marketing	SIC	7021	PR & communication activities	15,580	9,200	
	SIC	7311	Advertising agencies	50,880	44,740	
	SIC	7312	Media representation	17,030	11,680	
	SOC	1132	Marketing and sales directors			244,640
	SOC	1134	Advertising and Public Relations Directors			15,080
	SOC	2473	Advertising accounts managers and creative directors			6,070
	SOC	3543	Marketing associate professionals			122,400
Architecture	SIC	7111	Architectural activities	60,470	32,910	
	SOC	2431	Architects			12,900
	SOC	2432	Town planners			9,680
	SOC	2435	Chartered architectural technologists			770
	SOC	3121	Architectural and town planning technicians			10,440
Craft	SIC	3109	Manufacture of other furniture	18,860	27,490	
	SOC	5211	Smiths and forge workers			5,250
	SOC	5411	Weavers and knitters			2,430
	SOC	5412	Upholsterers			9,820
	SOC	5423	Print finishing and binding workers			16,170
	SOC	5441	Glass and ceramics makers, decorators and finishers			10,420
	SOC	5442	Furniture makers and other craft woodworkers			34,370
	SOC	5449	Other skilled trades n.e.c.			31,130
Design and designer fashion	SIC	7410	Specialised design activities	55,280	40,120	
	SOC	3421	Graphic Designers			23,460
	SOC	3422	Product, Clothing and related designers			26,850
Film, TV, video, radio and photography	SIC	5911	Motion picture, video & TV programme production activities	41,740	14,810	
	SIC	5912	Motion picture, video & TV programme post-production activities	3,110	1,900	
	SIC	5913	Motion picture, video & TV programme distribution activities	830	3,640	
	SIC	5914	Motion picture projection activities	2,570	15,480	
	SIC	6010	Radio broadcasting	12,390	5,620	
	SIC	6020	TV programming & broadcasting activities	20,820	17,760	
	SIC	7420	Photographic activities	35,150	11,160	
	SOC	3417	Photographers, audio-visual and broadcasting equipment operators			12,640
IT, software and computer services	SIC	6201	Computer programming activities	126,550	85,240	
	SIC	6202	Computer consultancy activities	85,630	137,720	

	SOC	1136	Information technology and telecommunications directors			82,370
	SOC	2135	IT business analysts, architects and systems designers			45,830
	SOC	2136	Programmers and software development professionals			135,990
	SOC	2137	Web design and development professionals			17,070
Music, performing and visual arts	SIC	5920	Sound recording & music publishing activities	3,870	3,690	
	SIC	8552	Cultural education	10,400	22,480	
	SIC	9001	Performing arts	31,180	9,260	
	SIC	9002	Support activities to performing arts	7,540	6,380	
	SIC	9003	Artistic creation	61,880	5,320	
	SIC	9004	Operation of arts facilities	7,680	13,590	
	SOC	3411	Artists			7,640
	SOC	3413	Actors, entertainers and presenters			19,310
	SOC	3414	Dancers and choreographers			5,080
	SOC	3415	Musicians			10,080
	SOC	3416	Arts officers, producers and directors			9,870
	SOC	2451	Librarians			28,600
	SOC	2452	Archivists & curators			8,100
Publishing	SIC	5811	Book publishing	22,460	21,790	
	SIC	5812	Publishing of directories and mailing lists	810	1,090	
	SIC	5813	Publishing of newspapers	23,160	26,910	
	SIC	5814	Publishing of journals & periodicals	26,620	17,460	
	SIC	5819	Other publishing activities	15,120	21,070	
	SIC	5821	Publishing of computer games	340	1,500	
	SIC	5829	Other software publishing	8,220	10,220	
	SIC	7430	Translation and interpretation activities	10,710	3,240	
	SOC	2471	Journalists, Newspaper and Periodical editors			9,740
	SOC	2472	Public relations professionals			22,500
	SOC	3412	Authors, writers and translators			16,090
Sub-totals				776,830	623,450	1,012,750
Grand Total						2,413,030

Broad CI Group	SIC/SOC	Code	SIC Description	Trident element 1 Total emp in creative occupations	Trident element 2 Total emp in non-creative occupations	Trident element 3 Total Emp in non-Creative Skillset SICs
Advertising and marketing	SIC	7021	PR & communication activities	15,580	9,200	

				Trident element 1	Trident element 2	Trident element 3
	SIC	7311	Advertising agencies	50,880	44,740	
	SIC	7312	Media representation	17,030	11,680	
	SOC	1132	Marketing and sales directors			244,640
	SOC	1134	Advertising and Public Relations Directors			15,080
	SOC	2473	Advertising accounts managers and creative directors			6,070
	SOC	3543	Marketing associate professionals			122,400
Architecture	SIC	7111	Architectural activities	60,470	32,910	
	SOC	2431	Architects			12,900
	SOC	2432	Town planners			9,680
	SOC	2435	Chartered architectural technologists			770
	SOC	3121	Architectural and town planning technicians			10,440
Craft	SIC	3109	Manufacture of other furniture	18,860	27,490	
	SOC	5211	Smiths and forge workers			5,250
	SOC	5411	Weavers and knitters			2,430
	SOC	5412	Upholsterers			9,820
	SOC	5423	Print finishing and binding workers			16,170
	SOC	5441	Glass and ceramics makers, decorators and finishers			10,420
	SOC	5442	Furniture makers and other craft woodworkers			34,370
	SOC	5449	Other skilled trades n.e.c.			31,130
Design and designer fashion	SIC	7410	Specialised design activities	55,280	40,120	
	SOC	3421	Graphic Designers			23,460
	SOC	3422	Product, Clothing and related designers			26,850
Film, TV, video, radio and photography	SIC	5911	Motion picture, video & TV programme production activities	41,740	14,810	
	SIC	5912	Motion picture, video & TV programme post-production activities	3,110	1,900	
	SIC	5913	Motion picture, video & TV programme distribution activities	830	3,640	
	SIC	5914	Motion picture projection activities	2,570	15,480	
	SIC	6010	Radio broadcasting	12,390	5,620	
	SIC	6020	TV programming & broadcasting activities	20,820	17,760	
	SIC	7420	Photographic activities	35,150	11,160	
	SOC	3417				12,640
IT, software and computer services	SIC	6201	Computer programming activities	126,550	85,240	
	SIC	6202	Computer consultancy activities	85,630	137,720	
	SOC	1136	Information technology and telecommunications directors			82,370

				Trident element 1	Trident element 2	Trident element 3
	SOC	2135	IT business analysts, architects and systems designers			45,830
	SOC	2136	Programmers and software development professionals			135,990
	SOC	2137	Web design and development professionals			17,070
Music, performing and visual arts	SIC	5920	Sound recording & music publishing activities	3,870	3,690	
	SIC	8552	Cultural education	10,400	22,480	
	SIC	9001	Performing arts	31,180	9,260	
	SIC	9002	Support activities to performing arts	7,540	6,380	
	SIC	9003	Artistic creation	61,880	5,320	
	SIC	9004	Operation of arts facilities	7,680	13,590	
	SOC	3411	Artists			7,640
	SOC	3413	Actors, entertainers and presenters			19,310
	SOC	3414	Dancers and choreographers			5,080
	SOC	3415	Musicians			10,080
	SOC	3416	Arts officers, producers and directors			9,870
	SOC	2451	Librarians			28,600
	SOC	2452	Archivists & curators			8,100
Publishing	SIC	5811	Book publishing	22,460	21,790	
	SIC	5812	Publishing of directories and mailing lists	810	1,090	
	SIC	5813	Publishing of newspapers	23,160	26,910	
	SIC	5814	Publishing of journals & periodicals	26,620	17,460	
	SIC	5819	Other publishing activities	15,120	21,070	
	SIC	5821	Publishing of computer games	340	1,500	
	SIC	5829	Other software publishing	8,220	10,220	
	SIC	7430	Translation and interpretation activities	10,710	3,240	
	SOC	2471	Journalists, Newspaper and Periodical editors			9,740
	SOC	2472	Public relations professionals			22,500
	SOC	3412	Authors, writers and translators			16,090
	Sub-totals				776,830	623,450
Grand Total						2,413,030

Source: Annual Population Survey October 2010 to September 2011 (TBR Ref: W2/S10a)